PARATEXTUAL REFRAMING OF VISUAL ELEMENTS IN AL JAZEERA’S COVERAGE OF THE 2022 CONFLICT BETWEEN RUSSIA AND UKRAINE

Karina AlOteibi¹, Ahmad S Haider², Hadeel AlSaed³

¹,²,³Department of English Language and Translation, Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan
²,³MEU Research Unit, Middle East University, Amman, Jordan

Abstract: Since it started in February 2022, the Russian-Ukrainian War has gained the interest of numerous news organizations. The reframing of visual elements of ten news items about the Russian-Ukrainian War is examined in this study. The Arabic versions are extracted from the Al Jazeera website, while the original articles were taken from The Atlantic and Foreign Affairs. Baker’s narrative theory is used in this paper (Baker, 2018). Comparing the visual elements in the English articles to their Arabic equivalents allowed researchers to pinpoint how they are paratextually reframed in the translated versions. The findings showed that Al Jazeera occasionally produces various, varied, and incongruent interpretations of the narrative. This could lead to multiple and, occasionally, dissimilar perspectives on the same story. The findings showed that Al Jazeera utilized paratextual reframing strategies involving visual elements, such as images, videos, and typographical features, to reframe the Russian-Ukrainian War. The research suggests that while the original media outlets initially framed the war according to their agenda, Al Jazeera altered this frame in the translated text. As a result, the target audience’s perception of the event under examination may change during the entire process.

Keywords: Russian-Ukrainian conflict, paratextual framing, visual elements, Al Jazeera, Arabic

About the author: Karina AlOteibi is an MA holder in Audiovisual and Mass Media Translation at the Applied Science Private University. Her main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, pragmatics, and translation studies.
e-mail: karinaoteibi1990@hotmail.com

About the author: Ahmad S Haider is an associate professor in the Department of English Language and Translation at the Applied Science Private University, Amman, Jordan. He received his Ph.D. in Linguistics from the University of Canterbury/ New Zealand. His current research focuses on how political events are socially, discursively, and linguistically represented in media, combining Corpus Linguistics and (Critical) Discourse Analysis. His main areas of interest include corpus linguistics, discourse analysis, and translation studies. Dr. Haider has built different large Arabic and English corpora. He professionally masters different Corpus Linguistic software packages.
e-mail: a_haidar@asu.edu.jo ORCID iD: http://orcid.org/0000-0002-7763-201X

About the author: Hadeel AlSaed is an associate professor at the Department of English Language and Translation Applied Science Private University (ASU). Dr. Saed received her Ph.D. in Curriculum and Methods of Teaching English from the University of Jordan in 2012. Her main areas of interest include second-language learning, first-language learning, translation studies, socio-linguistics, syntax, and phonetics. Dr. Saed has published many research articles in prestigious journals.
e-mail: h_alsaed@asu.edu.jo ORCID iD: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6833-2165

Copyright © 2024 Karina AlOteibi, Ahmad S Haider, Hadeel AlSaed
Article history: Received: 18 December 2023; Reviewed: 18 February 2024; Revised: 18 February 2024; Accepted: 26 February 2024; Published: 15 April 2024

This open access article is published and distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

Introduction

The Russian-Ukrainian War is one of the recent events that captured the attention of the entire world. According to Al-Duleimi and Al-Ebadi (2016), media outlets frequently have an ideological bias in favor of one of the parties to the conflict (Dibas, Rabab’a & Haider, 2022). Hence, News reporters and translators may be impartial in their reporting (Al-Salman & Haider, 2021).

After the Revolution for Dignity in February 2014, Russia seized control of Crimea from Ukraine and backed pro-Russian separatists in their conflict against Ukrainian troops in the Donbas region. After that, things became worse, and on February 24, 2022, Russia attacked Ukraine in full force. According to Western officials, this war may be the biggest in Europe since 1945 in terms of scope. A humanitarian crisis was caused by the battle. Sanctions on Russia were imposed by the US, the EU, and other nations. Arab communities have been engaged in conversations regarding the adverse impacts of the Russian-Ukrainian War on the economies of multiple Arab nations due to the ongoing conflict.

There are claims that the strongman archetype, exemplified by Putin, serves as a source of inspiration for Arab populations, influencing global dynamics. Putin is depicted as the leader who countered Western efforts to democratize Eastern Europe, established Russian energy dominance over the West, intervened in the US presidential elections, and supported the stability of the Syrian regime. Additionally, the war has already had an impact on several industries in the Arab world, including tourism, agricultural imports, and the oil and gas industries. The Assad regime in Syria stands out as the sole Arab government with a genuine pro-Putin stance, while the majority of other Arab states prioritize their relationships with the West. However, this does not imply that Arab countries and the Kremlin are in conflict. Instead, they often view Russia as a significant global power that remains relevant in their region and occasionally undertakes initiatives that serve their interests.

While there are limited studies examining the reframing of narratives in media translation (Al Sharif, 2009; Allawzi, Al-Jabri, Ammari & Ali, 2022; Qin & Zhang, 2018; Smadi, Obeidat & Haider, 2022), this research holds significance for its examination of the reframing of the Russian-Ukrainian War, a contentious issue with global ramifications.

The paratextual visual elements of ten news items about the Russian-Ukrainian War are examined in this piece of research. The Arabic articles are collected from the Al Jazeera website, while the original articles were taken from The

Atlantic and Foreign Affairs. This article argues that when translated into the target language, the source materials undergo a process of reframing in order to conform to the agenda of the media outlets from which they originate. These are:

1. What are the visual elements that Al Jazeera used in reframing the Russian-Ukrainian War narratives?

2. How do paratextual reframing techniques of visual elements impact the narratives surrounding the Russian-Ukrainian War?

Review of Related Literature

Political Media and Translation

The spread of political media depends heavily on translation. However, as Bhatia and Ritchie (2014) noted, the translation of political media necessitates careful consideration of linguistic, cultural, and political elements. This is because political media frequently uses colloquial terms, cultural references, and political views that might be challenging to translate accurately.

The public heavily relies on mass media outlets as a source of important information on current events (Haider, 2019a; Haider & Hussein, 2020). However, due to limitations in time and space, these outlets inevitably have to filter out certain events, stories, and aspects. Although many media outlets assert their impartiality and claim to prioritize news based solely on its newsworthiness, they frequently face accusations from journalism watchdogs and political think tanks of demonstrating systematic bias in their selection process (Al-Abbas & Haider, 2020). This ongoing criticism underscores the challenges of maintaining journalistic integrity in today’s media landscape. They claim that the outlets tend to favor either the owners’ and journalists’ interests or cater to the preferences of their target audience (Abu Rumman & Haider, 2023; Haider, 2019b). This phenomenon, known as media bias, has been extensively studied in the literature related to political science, economics, and communication (Niculae, Suen, Zhang, Danescu-Niculescu-Mizil & Leskovec, 2015). Theoretical explanations categorize media bias based on where choices are made about what to report. This encompasses the selection of topics and specifics addressed (issue and facts bias), the manner in which information is conveyed (framing bias), or the approach taken in discussions (ideological stance bias) (Niculae et al., 2015).

Political media can also be translated with a particular audience in mind. For example, Koskinen (2014) suggests that political speeches can be translated to emphasize certain political ideologies or values. This action can significantly impact how the public perceives political discourse. One of the decisive criteria
differentiating talented translators from others is the political background knowledge of the translators about culture-specific and sensitive characteristics of both SL and TL cultures (Schäffner, 2007).

Media outlets can use different ideological strategies to reach their goals shaped by political and ideological agendas. For example, Shunnaq (1992) sheds light on monitoring and managing methods. In the former scenario, the media outlet endeavors to elucidate events by presenting available evidence without interference, whereas in the latter, it seeks to manipulate and shape events to align with its political agendas. As a result, the media outlet is seen as an event observer when it employs the monitoring strategy. In contrast, it is regarded as a component of the event itself in the managing strategy.

News translation has specific characteristics that distinguish this translation’s branch from any other type. These qualities include using straightforward, direct, and appropriate language for all reading levels, which is the main objective of news translators, as news is intended for a broad audience rather than a particular social class. Furthermore, news translators need to adhere to the policies of the news agency, as they are tasked with adapting news articles to a specific context within a limited time, space, and cultural constraints. Furthermore, news translators frequently fulfill roles as proofreaders and back-translators. Moreover, they must prioritize objectivity over faithfulness to the source text, as objectivity is a fundamental principle of news agencies (Bielsa, 2007).

**Empirical Studies**

Various research studies have explored the translation of political texts into different languages, analyzing the utilization of reframing strategies in the process. For example, Alibabaee and Shokohipoor (2016) investigated the impact of wartime periods on political text translation, concentrating specifically on MEMRI’s tactics for constructing and disseminating chosen narratives. This empirical study revealed MEMRI’s deliberate use of translation strategies in paratextual elements such as titles, headings, and introductions by studying 37 selected dispatches through narrative theory and framing. These devices sought to underscore Iranians’ perceived hostility toward Israel and occasionally incorporated imagery to call Iran’s credibility into question. According to the study, these methods are consistent with MEMRI’s tendency to present Iran as a potential threat to Israel, revealing light on the intricate interplay of translation, conflict, and framing strategies in political discourse.

Garritzen (2018) examined the often-overlooked role of paratexts in shaping textual production and reception. This empirical study expands on this topic by delving into John Richard Green’s *Short History of the English People*, a late Victorian phenomenon, using an interdisciplinary lens including book history,
Studies in Linguistics, Culture and FLT - Volume 12, Issue 1. ISSN 2534-9538

historiography, and literary criticism. This study reveals the transformational impact of paratexts in scholarly discourse by methodically investigating paratexts in the original 1874 edition and comparing them to those in four posthumous editions prepared by Alice Stopford Green. It highlights how paratexts influence the acceptance and success of academic literature, as well as how the book’s meaning and worth change through time. The paratexts of the Short History serve as dynamic entry points that shape readers’ understanding of the narrative, from its inception as a proto-social history to its transformation into a vehicle for promoting English patriotism and, ultimately, advocating a nationalist interpretation of Irish history. This study emphasizes the importance of widening our understanding of scientific narratives to include paratextual aspects, highlighting the complex processes of knowledge transmission and presentation to readers.

The study on the Arabic translation of Joe Sacco’s Footnotes in Gaza by Dubbati and Abudayeh (2018) combines narrative theory and discourse analysis to investigate the translator’s paratextual effects. According to the research, the Palestinian translator sees himself as an activist working to change people’s perceptions of the Palestinian cause. The translator depicts Palestinians as victims of Israeli oppression and heroes of resistance through paratextual interventions, aligning with his political sympathies and Arab readers’ expectations. While these interventions do not fundamentally change the source text’s tone, they provide valuable insights into the translator’s role in reframing narratives in translation, especially in the context of politically charged works, distinguishing it from instances of deliberate misrepresentation in Arab-Israeli conflict translations.

The study of Persian translations of Western-authored political texts about the Iran-Iraq war by Yalsharzeh, Barati, and Hesabi (2019) using narrative theory and the concept of narrative framing reveals the significant role of paratextual elements in reframing and ideologically positioning the readers. Using framing approaches to analyze the paratexts, particularly the prefaces and footnotes, the study demonstrates that paratexts are powerful ideological devices, reflecting and replicating existing ideological systems while giving counter-narratives. Paratexts are more than just an introduction; they offer a second chance to reject Western narratives and promote native ones. The authorship of paratexts actively contributes to the connotation and molding of societal reality. The research focuses on the institutional foundations of discursive processes in translation. It emphasizes the political consequences of paratexts in justifying and challenging war narratives, providing insights into Iranian institutional and ideological narratives to not only translation studies but also political science. It also depicts paratextual authorship as a process characterized by disparities and tensions, emphasizing its importance in framing and contesting narratives.
Another study by Tao and Gu (2020) on the diachronic reframing of the Chinese classic *Xiyou ji* (Journey to the West) in English provides a comprehensive exploration of the transformation and popularization of Chinese literature in the Western context over the last century. The study, which employs paratextual analysis and narrative theory, illustrates how renowned translators kept the basic narrative structure while changing the genre and narrative tone, providing a new perspective on the story. In other words, they reframed the narrative under multiple paratextual elements.

Smadi et al. (2022) investigated the role of translation in reframing various narratives of the Christchurch Mosque Shootings. Their focus was on how translators utilized the paratextual components of 12 pairs of English and Arabic articles to reframe the terror assault and propagate the ideological attitudes of the media outlets they work for. By examining the social media sites of one of the investigated media outlets, namely MEMRI, they showed the possible impact of media translation in shaping public perceptions and opinions regarding the image of Islam in the West.

The study by Mowafy and Mohamed (2023) emphasizes the importance of paratextuality in affecting the reception and perception of translated texts. It uses the case of George Orwell’s *Animal Farm* in Arabic translations as an example of how paratextual features can influence the cultural stereotyping and ideological framing of a literary work, particularly in the context of the Arab Spring protests. The study shows how paratexts function as sites for translational and editorial intervention, influencing readers’ comprehension of the story. The examination of paratextual features in four selected translations illustrates how each translator retells the story, emphasizing its political implications at the expense of its other literary and cultural nuances. This inclination toward a political interpretation, reinforced by the paratextual features, limits the novella’s potential for multilayered readings and ignores its fairy tale parts.

After a thorough examination of the existing literature, and as far as the researchers are aware, no prior studies have investigated the paratextual reframing of visual elements pertaining to the 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War in translation. This study seeks to rectify and bridge this research gap.

**Methodology**

**Investigated Media Outlets**

As previously noted, this study scrutinizes three media outlets. It compares the English source texts from *The Atlantic* and *Foreign Affairs* with the Arabic target articles published by *Al Jazeera*. 
**Al Jazeera**

Established in 1996, *Al Jazeera* is a renowned news network headquartered in Qatar, boasting a global presence with over 80 offices worldwide. Notably, *Al Jazeera* Arabic emerged as the first independent news outlet in the Arab world committed to delivering extensive news coverage and live discussions (AlOteibi, Haider & AlSaed, 2023). By challenging traditional media taboos in the region, such as featuring Israeli officials and interacting with Arab governments, *Al Jazeera* has played a pivotal role in providing the Arab populace with access to modern journalism.

This network represents a prominent Arabic-language news channel that has exerted a substantial influence on the media environment in the Arab region (AlOteibi et al., 2023). *Al Jazeera’s* editorial approach is guided by a set of core principles. Initially, the network strives to provide a unique angle distinct from mainstream media by presenting thorough coverage of news events from both local and global viewpoints. Additionally, it endeavors to act as an impartial and fair source of information, encouraging analytical thinking and offering diverse perspectives. *Al Jazeera* upholds principles of free expression and advocates for democratic ideals. It openly discusses human rights concerns and supports pro-democracy movements across the Arab region, aiming to amplify the voices of marginalized individuals and groups (Figenschou, 2013).

**The Atlantic**

Founded in Boston in 1857, *The Atlantic* is a highly respected American magazine and multi-platform publisher known for its wide-ranging content covering politics, business, international relations, culture, arts, technology, and science. Over the years, it has built a strong reputation nationwide for championing meaningful careers and spotlighting emerging poets and writers. Beyond that, *The Atlantic* serves as a platform for insightful writers to express their perspectives on pressing contemporary political matters, including but not limited to abolition, education, and various other crucial issues shaping our world today (AlOteibi et al., 2023). Additionally, the magazine plays a vital role in fostering public discourse and intellectual exploration.

*The Atlantic* remains committed to fostering open-minded discussions that encourage robust intellectual exploration and welcome diverse viewpoints for its audience. Without aligning with any specific political or ideological agenda, it promotes thoughtful analysis and places significant value on critical thinking. Consequently, its editorial team emphasizes the importance of questioning conventional beliefs by considering ideas from various political perspectives while also advocating for thorough reporting on global issues like international conflicts, diplomacy, and development to facilitate a comprehensive understanding of global complexities.
**Foreign Affairs**

*Foreign Affairs*, an American magazine established by the Council on Foreign Relations (CFR) in 1922, has transformed over the years into a multi-platform media entity offering a range of services, including print publications, websites, mobile applications, and social media channels (AlOteibi et al., 2023). Its audience comprises a diverse array of international subscribers with varying interests.

The nature of the publications of *Foreign Affairs* transcends mere coverage, delving into in-depth intellectual analysis that independently sheds light on diverse viewpoints, devoid of any particular ideological framework that aligns with or opposes any specific stance. The magazine’s editorial team leans towards conducting thorough investigations and analyses rooted in credible information. Their goal is to furnish readers with a comprehensive understanding of intricate global matters, recognizing that these issues often carry multiple interpretations and call for a range of policy recommendations.

**Data Collection and Corpus Size**

This study’s primary focus lies in articles originally composed in English and subsequently translated into Arabic. A parallel corpus was compiled to investigate this, containing ten pairs of articles covering the Russian-Ukrainian War. These articles were published between February and October 2022. The English source texts totaled 22,170 words, while the Arabic translations contained 19,416 words. The initial set of five English source articles originated from *The Atlantic* media platform, while the subsequent five were obtained from the website of *Foreign Affairs* Magazine. The Arabic translations of all ten articles were sourced from *Al Jazeera’s* official website. The collected data were then categorized into two primary sub-corpora based on language: an English sub-corpus consisting of original English texts (source language/SL) and an Arabic counterpart featuring the Arabic translations of the English articles (target language/TL).

**Procedures**

This research followed the procedures listed below:

- Selecting a newsworthy event that was widely reported by the media. The 2022 Russian-Ukrainian War was chosen.
- Seeking out Arabic and English-language news outlets and broadcasters who covered the event. Three major news organizations: *Al Jazeera*, *Foreign Affairs*, and *The Atlantic*, were chosen.
- Ten sets of articles, each consisting of both Arabic and English versions, were sourced from the websites of the three news organizations.
Contrasting the visual elements of English and Arabic articles.
Recognizing the instances where visual elements were para-textually reframed

Analysis and Findings

This section examines the paratextual framing strategies used by Al Jazeera and their role in reframing the Russian-Ukrainian War. These strategies include images, videos, and typography. News outlets employ a combination of visual and linguistic communication modes to convey meaning and distribute information. Visual communication involves the transmission of information, ideas, and facts through symbols and images.

In political discourse, visual elements refer to any visual component, such as images, videos, symbols, and typography, used to convey or reinforce a message. They play a critical role in media discourse, as they can evoke emotions, convey complex ideas, and influence the audience’s perception of political events.

Media translation is an essential aspect of political discourse analysis as it involves translating visual and verbal elements across diverse languages and cultural contexts. Al Jazeera, in its translation, frequently uses many types of different visual components, and such paratextual features could influence the story’s interpretation of critical events (AlOteibi et al., 2023).

Images

Images, which include all forms of photos, cartoons, and maps, are fundamental aspects of media. They can influence and modify the receivers’ perceptions of a news article before they ever start reading it. In reframing narratives, Al Jazeera sometimes replaces images under the main title or adds new images throughout the text in the article.

Images under the articles’ headlines are the first aspect that catches the eye of the reader, and this could be the reason why they play a significant role in reframing narratives in media translation. Al Jazeera, in almost all investigated cases, replaced the main picture under the title with a new one to convey a particular point of view that serves its agenda. Table 1 shows examples of changing images under the titles.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT (Al Jazeera)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image6.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td><img src="image7.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image8.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1. Examples of image framing*
In example 1, *Al Jazeera* replaced the image of the source article, extracted from *The Atlantic*, with a new image in the target text. In the source image, a Crimean Tatar is holding the Crimean Tatar flag. This flag and the Ukrainian national flag have the same colors, namely blue and yellow. However, *Al Jazeera* replaced this image with Crimean Tatar women protesting against the war with a poster in Russian that reads “НЕТ-ВОЙНЕ!” (Lit. No war!). Thus, *Al Jazeera* made it clear to its audience that the Crimean Tatars were against the war. It should be noted that since the annexation of Crimea by the Russian Federation in 2014, Crimean Tatars have reportedly been subjected to harassment and discrimination by Russian authorities, with cases of torture, arbitrary detention, and enforced disappearance.

In example 2, the article talks about Russia’s potential use of nuclear weapons in Ukraine. The source image, which shows a close-up of Putin in a newspaper, does not directly relate to the topic and provides no specific information about the article’s content, which could be seen as a lack of relevance to the reader. On the other hand, the image used by *Al Jazeera*, which shows modern military equipment, is more directly related to the article’s topic. Using military equipment in the image suggests a sense of potential danger, implying that Russia may be preparing for military action. The target image is also more visually striking and attention-grabbing than the source one, which is an attempt to engage the reader more effectively.

As for example 3, *Al Jazeera*, to some extent, used a similar image but deleted the caption of the source article’s image. The English caption in the source article “Destroyed Russian tanks and armored personnel carriers, Izium, Ukraine, September 2022” expressed the situation of the Russian forces and let the readers know exactly who owns the battered tanks. *Al Jazeera* did not translate the caption, so the audience may be confused as to which party the wrecked tanks belong to. Such gestures may make the article more intriguing and urge the audience to read the entire article. In addition, it may implicate a “middle-of-the-road” position toward the war.

Finally, in example 4, the source image showing the Russian flag eating the Ukrainian flag suggests Russia’s hostile and aggressive stance towards Ukraine. This image is highly metaphorical and suggestive, as it portrays the act of one nation consuming another, which can be seen as a form of dominance and subjection. On the other hand, the image used by *Al Jazeera* suggests a more specific scenario. The tank is a symbol of military power, and its presence on the map indicates that Russia is invading Ukrainian territory. The world map provides a broader context and a sense of geographical zone, which helps the reader understand the scope and scale of the conflict. Also, the flags used in both images as symbols are significant and represent national identity and sovereignty.
As discussed earlier, images are crucial for documenting events, illuminating concepts, and summarizing ideas. Moreover, images heavily influence the audience’s reaction to news articles. While the English sources of the narratives have not inserted any images/photos throughout their articles except for the ones under the main title, *Al Jazeera* extensively inserted images in its translations to better attract target readers visually. Table 2 shows examples of adding images throughout the text.

**Table 2. Example of adding images throughout the text**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT (<em>Al Jazeera</em>)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>-</td>
<td><img src="image1.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td><img src="image2.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In example 5, *Al Jazeera* inserted a new image with a caption in the middle of the article. The Arabic caption in the TT is translated as, “In early September, the Russians were surprised by an intense Ukrainian attack targeting their forces around “Kharkiv,” leading to the defeat and chaotic retreat of the Russian troops on the 10th of the same month and their chaotic retreat (Reuters)”. This caption, along with the image, shows what happened to the Russian forces in September 2022 and how they were defeated. Also, the caption distances *Al Jazeera* from its content by ascribing it to Reuters; in this way, they relieve themselves of responsibility for any given information.

In example 6, the image can be analyzed through paratextual framing, as it visually illustrates the article’s central message. An image showing two people holding the Ukrainian flag and a sign that reads “STOP PUTIN’S WAR” in Al Jazeera’s translation of the article provides a human face to the conflict, showing
that ordinary people are negatively affected by the war. Moreover, this image is most likely meant to invoke feelings of support for Ukraine and condemn Russia’s involvement in the conflict, aligning with Al Jazeera’s political stance. The channel has been known to provide extensive coverage of the conflict, often taking a pro-Ukrainian stance (Mohamed, 2023). According to Baker (2006), using images that highlight the human impact of the conflict, such as the one described, is a common tactic applied in the media to generate sympathy and support for one side of the conflict.

In example 7, the image extracted by Al Jazeera portrays a group of people protesting and holding Crimean Tatar and Ukrainian flags. The caption in Arabic under the image translates as “Today, as they defend their country against the full and harsh invasion of Russian forces, Ukrainians and Crimean Tatars are also defending their right to live together in one homeland.” The image and its caption imply that the protesters in the picture are against Russia’s invasion of Ukraine and they are defending their right to coexist in a single nation. In place of a clear territorial war, the picture reframes the Ukrainian conflict as a fight for autonomy and the right to peaceful coexistence. Moreover, using the flags further emphasizes the concept of national solidarity in the face of foreign invasion. The word “invasion” in the caption suggests that the Russian forces are not welcome in Ukraine, and the reference to the “harsh” nature of the invasion further highlights the idea of the struggle against an aggressive external power.

In example 8, the image represents the abandoned old house in the Chornobyl zone, which most probably creates a haunting and creepy atmosphere. In 1986, the world witnessed a disaster at Chornobyl that devastated both the environment and human lives. Abandoned buildings like the one pictured remain visual reminders of past trauma and continued security concerns. Al Jazeera’s recent focused coverage of Russian activities in Chornobyl relates to the discussion in the article, which has raised concerns about the region’s security and the risks of further contamination. Al Jazeera apparently used this image to catch the reader’s eye and highlight how challenging the Chornobyl situation was.

Overall, it should be noted that such images are not entirely objective. Regarding paratextual image framing, Al Jazeera tends to replace the source images under the main title as well as to add images throughout the text for explicitly political purposes, which may influence readers’ understanding of a topic. Furthermore, news articles choose images carefully with an aim to improve entertainment quality while effectively communicating its essence to readers. However, we must view these images critically by never forgetting the possible biases and motivations behind such choices embedded within editorial contextual framing, usually invisible to us as media consumers.
Videos

A video is a sequence of moving images that convey information or messages through visual and auditory means. It is a medium that combines sound and images to create a narrative or tell a story and is considered to be one of the most effective forms of content for capturing and controlling the attention of viewers (Mendez, 2017). According to Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007), videos can be used for various objectives, such as entertainment, education, promotion, and communication. In recent years, the popularity of videos has grown exponentially and has become an essential part of media translation.

*Al Jazeera* frequently adds videos to its translations of articles related to the Russian-Ukrainian war, which helps rethink the narrative of the conflict. The reformulation of narratives in media translation involves the presentation of information that challenges the dominant and predominant narrative and offers alternative points of view (Chesterman, 2016). *Al Jazeera* may challenge the dominant narrative of the war and offer a more nuanced picture of the situation by presenting videos that reflect other viewpoints and shed light on the conflict’s human cost (Sibson, 2012). Additionally, using videos in media translation can help increase audience engagement. DeLane (2019) noted that videos are more likely to be shared on social media and have a more elevated attention rate than text-based content. Table 3 shows examples of adding videos throughout the translated text.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>TT (<em>Al Jazeera</em>)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>ايناركوأ اي سور مجاهت اذامل ..ملاعلا تاديدهت مغر نيويتوب تضببق ..!شراشلا هذهب</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
<td>Putin’s grip despite world threats... Why is Russia attacking Ukraine with such ferocity?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>رغم تهديدات العالم لماذا يهاجم بوتين أوكرانيا بهذه الشراسة؟</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H0NlrNbEYoA&amp;t=85s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H0NlrNbEYoA&amp;t=85s</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>برحلا يفرط ىلع دعاق!إ ضرفب أدب ايناركوأ تيفر اتشنلا لصرف</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Literal Translation</td>
<td>Winter in Ukraine has begun to impose its rhythm on both sides of the war.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>TT (Al Jazeera)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td><a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=es2sOGUcZoI&amp;t=166s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=es2sOGUcZoI&amp;t=166s</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>ييوونلا ليبونريشت قطح لع طحم رطيست قيسورلا تاوقلا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>The Russian forces have taken control of the Chornobyl nuclear power plant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Literal</td>
<td>The Russian forces have taken control of the Chornobyl nuclear power plant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Translation</td>
<td>The Russian forces have taken control of the Chornobyl nuclear power plant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ukBhaxB4qRg">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ukBhaxB4qRg</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>يلع قيسورلا برحلا يف مدخشلا ثلثلا زربأ لع فرعت ايناركوا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Get to know the most prominent weapons used in the Russian war on Ukraine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Literal</td>
<td>Get to know the most prominent weapons used in the Russian war on Ukraine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Translation</td>
<td>Get to know the most prominent weapons used in the Russian war on Ukraine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The Atlantic</td>
<td><a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FuAKTXWHdC0">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FuAKTXWHdC0</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In example 9, the video inserted by *Al Jazeera* provides a detailed analysis of the Ukraine conflict’s roots and explores the main motives for the Russian attack. In addition, it highlights how severe economic sanctions imposed on Russia and threats of diplomatic and economic isolation from Western nations did not stop Putin from insisting on invading Ukraine to overthrow its current government. The video adds an essential dimension to the news article and gives a comprehensive view of the situation, making it more accessible and informative to the target audience.

In example 10, the video added by *Al Jazeera* represents the ongoing battle in Ukraine and how the opposing troops are frantically trying to gain an advantage before the weather worsens. It also draws attention to how the conflict affects civilians, in particular, how it may endanger electrical facilities and infrastructure and have a negative effect on the population. In addition, such videos portray the conflict’s human impact, which the original text may have yet to convey adequately. Consequently, this helps shift the story’s focus from a purely political or economic philosophy and perspective to a more human-centered one. According to Munday (2016), audiovisual elements such as videos often significantly impact audiences as they are more engaging and can convey emotions more effectively.

In example 11, the video provides important information about the current situation in northern Ukraine, where Russian forces have taken control of the Chornobyl nuclear power station. In addition, the video includes an interview with an expert in the field of nuclear energy, emphasizing the potential environmental risks posed by this action. Most probably, the viewer feels empathy and concern for the situation when interviews and video footage from the affected areas are included. Using such videos in translation is crucial for reframing narratives in the media. Videos can aid in challenging dominant narratives and delivering a more nuanced knowledge of complicated subjects by giving audiences access to various ideas and perspectives. In this way, videos can be incredibly helpful in fostering a stronger sense of empathy and cultural understanding.

In example 12, the video inserted by *Al Jazeera* most likely attempts to inform its Arabic-speaking audience about the types of weapons that both sides have used in the ongoing war in Ukraine. The video highlights the use by the Russian military of modern weapons such as tanks, fighter jets, bombers, attack helicopters, and thermobaric bombers, as well as the deployment of US and British missiles by the Ukrainian military to fight Russian forces. Moreover, by displaying the diversity and sophistication of the weaponry utilized in the war, the video may be intended to illustrate the gravity of the situation and the risk of escalation. It might also be interpreted as a call for greater international action and attention to put an end to the recent violence in Ukraine.
Overall, integrating videos in articles can help people understand them better since videos provide a visual depiction of the events and situations being addressed, which can help viewers understand the context and implications of the events being discussed. Moreover, videos can feature interviews with involved parties or expert analysis, offering additional insights that can further enrich the audience’s knowledge. They can also stimulate and provoke the audience’s emotions, which strengthens the article’s message. It is also worth noting that Al Jazeera’s choice to include such videos to its audience is motivated by the importance of visual media in attracting and maintaining viewers, as visual media are more engaging and successful in transmitting and conveying information than textual media (Cruse, 2006). Therefore, adding videos to the translation can enhance the news story’s overall quality, making it more accessible to a broader audience.

At some points, when analyzing the translation of Al Jazeera, one could feel that this channel is engaged in steganography. The concept of steganography involves concealing secret and sometimes private information within a cover media, such as an image, audio, or video file, in a way that it remains undetected by unintended recipients (Meghanathan & Nayak, 2010). The technique provides a hidden means of exchanging information while also protecting intellectual property rights; since the channel frequently uses visual materials in their translations, one would suspect that they wish to transmit concealed information to their intended audience. The concept of hidden meaning is used in both steganography and the philosophy of reframing narratives in media translation. The purpose of steganography is to conceal information within a cover media in such a way that unwanted recipients cannot easily detect it. The hidden message is embedded within the cover media and can only be detected by using proper steganalysis algorithms. Similarly, the theory of reframing narratives in media translation involves the concept of hidden meaning by manipulating and exploiting the narrative framing of a message. This can be done by changing the way the message is presented or adding new elements such as images, video, and audio to change its meaning. Once again, the aim is to subtly shape the audience’s perception of the message without being too obvious.

Typography
The typographic design is closely linked to visual and pictorial aspects (Gambier & Van Doorslaer, 2010). Typography is the practice of arranging type to enhance the readability, legibility, and visual appeal of written text. When it comes to media translation, this practice is crucial as it helps to convey the tone, style, and cultural sensitivity of the source text to the target audience in an appropriate manner. Well-designed typography can improve the clarity, consistency, and
impact of a translated message, while poorly performed typography, on the other hand, can reduce the message’s influence and the user’s experience.

Typography is undoubtedly important in media accessibility since it facilitates reading and understanding for viewers with sensory disabilities, as pointed out by (Díaz-Cintas, Orero & Remael, 2007). Moreover, Gambier and Van Doorslaer (2010) stress the cultural and linguistic implications of typography in multimedia translation, where typography can convey cultural norms, identities, and values. By manipulating the typography and layout in a translation, a translator can stress or downplay certain aspects of the source text or convey a particular tone or message to the target audience. Table 4 shows examples of paratextual typography framing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source ST</th>
<th>TT (Al Jazeera)</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Literal Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>But even if some of Ukraine's heating systems can be repaired, Moscow will attack again and again. According to the investigative news outlet Bellingcat, a secret military unit composed of 33 engineers based in Moscow is carefully directing the Kremlin’s targeting of Ukraine’s civilian infrastructure.</td>
<td>In Al Jazeera’s translation, “Bellingcat” is underlined and in blue. The reader will be directed to the other online article by clicking on it.</td>
<td>So, Moscow can attack it time and time again. According to the investigative journalism platform ‘Bellingcat,’ there is a secret military unit consisting of 33 engineers based in Moscow that carefully directs the Kremlin's air-strikes targeting Ukraine’s civilian infrastructure.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td>Now, with Russia’s invasion, the norm against territorial conquest has been tested in the most threatening and vivid way since the end of World War II.</td>
<td>The phrase “Russia’s invasion” is not underlined and does not suggest any link as in the ST.</td>
<td>Now, with Russia’s invasion of Ukraine, this norm appears to be under a challenging test in a frightening and explicit manner for the first time since World War II.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In example 13, in *Al Jazeera*’s translation, the word “Bellingcat” is underlined and in blue, which makes it stand out from the rest of the text. This typographical choice gives the source of information more credibility, as it implies that it is coming from a reputable news outlet. Additionally, both source and target texts provide us with links once we click on the word “Bellingcat.” Readers will be redirected to the website with another article titled: “The Remote Control Killers Behind Russia’s Cruise Missile Strikes on Ukraine.” Assuring that the target audience would comprehend the text similarly to the source audience by using this typography style in the TT is crucial for producing an accurate and culturally suitable translation. It is also assumed that in this way, *Al Jazeera* wants to win the trust of its viewers since its translation, in this example, is neutral and balanced. Therefore, this paratextual framing strategy can influence readers’ perception of the information presented and increase their trust in the source.

In example 14, the underlining of “Russia’s invasion” in the ST draws attention to it and highlights its importance in the discussed context. Furthermore, by clicking on this phrase, readers will automatically be taken to a new page with

---

2. The process through which certain words or expressions are made more visually noted to emphasize their priority or significance is known as highlighting.
an article titled “What Putin Really Wants in Ukraine, Russia Seeks to Stop NATO’s Expansion, Not to Annex More Territory,” thus providing additional information and context to the reader and drawing the reader’s attention to this specific event. However, in the TT, the underlining is not present, potentially changing how the reader perceives the phrase and suggesting that the translator did not consider this particular aspect of the text significant for the Arabic audience. Furthermore, while the underlined words in the ST suggest a link to a specific article, Al Jazeera did not provide this additional information in their translation. This action may cause confusion or a lack of context for the reader, who may want to find out more about the Russian invasion. Because of this, using special typographical features in the translation, in general, plays an essential role in highlighting specific terms, expressions, and events in a way that speaks of the importance of what is being said. Conversely, the absence of certain typographical features can change how the reader perceives the text. Consequently, typography is an essential consideration when interpreting and understanding a text since it has a significant impact on the overall message.

In example 15, the translation’s use of specific typography draws the reader’s attention to the poem’s lines and emphasizes their value in relation to the text as a whole. For example, the source text is shown in italics with a font size of 16.5, while the target text is in bold with a font size of 18. The ST’s use of italics sets the lines apart from the rest of the text and suggests that they are part of a poem. It also creates a visual distinction between the poem and the surrounding text, emphasizing it and grabbing the readers’ attention. While in the TT, writing the verse of the poem in bold makes the lines stand out even more than they do in the ST. The larger font size and boldness make the lines visually dominant and underline their significance in the translation. Also, using a bigger font size than the surrounding text (which is in 16) indicates that the poem is a subordinate element to the rest of the text. In addition, bold typography suggests a degree of urgency or intensity in the meaning and connotation of the verses, encouraging the reader to concentrate more on them.

In example 16, the translator has not effectively used typography to convey the same degree of emphasis and negative connotation as the ST. Specifically, the words “NO ONE CAN” are in all capital letters, which brings a sense of focus and draws attention to the fact that Putin’s ideas and thoughts cannot be directly known. Lupton (2014) emphasizes the expressive prospect of typography by stating that it can convey emotions, moods, attitudes, and personalities. She also highlights the role of typography in shaping the reader’s understanding and creating a visual aspect for the message. In the given translation, the typography is minimal, without any bold or italicized words to emphasize points or skew readership. The only exception is the use of diacritical marks, such as the shadda and sukun, which are used to show how particular Arabic letters and
words should be pronounced. This lack of typographical features makes the translation appear more neutral and balanced.

In general, the use of paratextual framing techniques, such as typography, can often reframe the presentation of a story or event in media translation. This can mean changing the narrative’s focus and principle while minimizing other details or creating entirely new stories based on the source material. Typography, according to Baker’s paratextual framing methods, can influence the reader’s story interpretation. It is part of the text’s paratext, which includes any items outside the text’s main body that can influence the reader’s reception. Moreover, typographic decisions like font size, color, and layout can convey the intended audience and the source text’s genre, tone, and cultural background. Baker (2018) argues that a selective highlighting framing strategy can be used manipulatively. For instance, selective highlighting can be achieved using bold, italics, or underlined fonts to engage the reader in specific words or phrases.

**Conclusions and Recommendations**

Through the examination of the employment of paratextual framing strategies, it is evident that *Al Jazeera* contributed to the reframing of the Russian-Ukrainian War for Arab readers. According to the analysis, various paratextual reframing of visual elements techniques were utilized to form and portray the narratives in various ways. Specific visual elements such as images, videos, and typographical features accompanying the articles influenced the readers’ interpretation by framing the narrative through carefully selected visual elements. The analysis demonstrates that these paratextual techniques are powerful tools for constructing and conveying narratives in diverse ways.

In the realm of media, such techniques play a pivotal role in molding public opinion, as they can emphasize certain aspects of a story, evoke emotional responses, and guide viewers or readers toward particular viewpoints. The strategic deployment of images, videos, and typographical features within media narratives significantly influences public discourse and shapes a collective understanding of critical events and issues. It highlights the need for media consumers to critically analyze the paratextual elements presented to them and be aware of how they can influence their perceptions and attitudes toward various cases and issues in our interconnected world.

Analyzing the paratextual visual components within the selected ten news articles on the Russian-Ukrainian War reveals how *Al Jazeera* framed the conflict narrative. While *Al Jazeera* aimed for a balanced approach, it appeared to lean favorably towards Ukraine in several instances, displaying empathy for its plight. This suggests that their translation efforts may have been influenced by biases or contextual factors that favored Ukraine over Russia. In summary, *Al Jazeera’s* coverage of the Russian-Ukrainian War lacked neutrality, veering
more towards a pro-Ukraine stance while expressing sympathy for its cause. To form informed perspectives on the matter, it is critical for individuals to critically evaluate multiple sources of information.

This paper holds several implications that should be considered. First of all, it highlights the influential role of media outlets like Al Jazeera in shaping narratives and perspectives on conflicts. Secondly, it also emphasizes the power of media institutions to shape public opinion through translation and framing choices. Thirdly, using various framing devices in translation creates varying views of the same story, underscoring the significance of translators in influencing audience perception. Finally, identifying framing devices sheds light on how narratives are constructed and manipulated.

The findings also hold implications for initiatives aimed at conflict resolution. Framing can reshape narratives in ways that greatly impact how the public perceives conflicts and their potential solutions, potentially bolstering diplomatic initiatives and peacebuilding endeavors. It is essential for policymakers, journalists, and those involved in conflict resolution to navigate these varied narratives effectively.

Furthermore, the impact of political and cultural settings on framing decisions must be acknowledged. Factors such as the audience’s cultural background, geographical dynamics, and editorial policies can all impact Al Jazeera’s reframing techniques. This emphasizes the importance of media diversity, as it can lead to contradictory narratives of a story in media debate. Additionally, this study emphasizes the significance of fostering media literacy and cultivating critical thinking skills among viewers, enabling them to recognize reframing tactics and prejudices within news reporting. Lastly, it underscores the criticality of adhering to ethical journalistic and translation standards that prioritize precision, impartiality, and openness to maintain the integrity of media content.

References


